

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - Feb 2021- Subject - Old V New -- Judge - David Skinner

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
1	487	2 Generations		Good choice for the Subject. Bubs is just as wrinkly as mum! Well-handled side lighting. Suggest darkening the sky to hold the viewer in the frame.
2	487	In Bloom-Dead		Well-handled depth of field in both images, however, the “new” would be much better as a fresh bloom without signs of dying as well, and it would be a stronger story to have both flowers of the same species
3	487	Lotus Shrine-Taj Mahal		Both images nice and sharp, both represent the Subject
4	487	Sporty and Fast-Not Going Anywhere		Both images are nice and sharp and portray the subject. Be careful not to crop too tightly. It would be more pleasing to the eye to have both vehicles pointing the same way
5	399	a new generation	C	Nicely done capturing the story in one image. Suggest improving is to get down lower at their level from a slightly different angle. With this image crop out the pavers in the corner and add a slight vignette
6	399	acorn and oak		Good attempt, but are the acorns placed? Does not quite sit right with the perception of very large acorns
7	431	Boots		Good attempt with the story to use boots. However, the “oldest” pair are not in focus which is a shame. The lighting has been done well, considering three different textures, especially the white boots
8	641	Cairo 2		Good choice on the panorama and the subject is met. However, the harsh light coupled with the sultry heavy atmosphere has not been the makers friend to capture the foreground as sharp as it could be.
9	641	Cairo	C	Certainly meets the brief. Story well told. Depth of field well-handled to have the pyramids a tad out of focus, that’s ok in this image. Suggest darkening the sky a tad

10	641	Clarence River		Well seen capturing the brief. Perhaps the high key/vignette may not be the best way to bring out this image The monotone treatment is well done but might lean too much towards the old. Colour might have worked better
11	770	Dhamma	HC	Well-chosen image for the brief. A monk in training, old culture on a smart phone. Well done, nice story here. Sharp where it needs to be, red/green works well
12	399	digging with grandpa		This image meets the brief well. Unfortunately, the subjects are out of focus, taken in harsh light that makes it difficult to get the exposure correctly with a bright sand background. One needs to be careful in choosing cherished family photos for camera club competitions, as other viewers (especially the judge) do not have the same emotional connection
13	601	Books v Technology	C	Well planned still life to portray the brief. Some technical improvements required on the light source. Too harsh on the books. One thing to be aware of, if there is writing, the viewer will read it. If the words on the phone was of a Dennis Wheatley novel, then a HC might have been in consideration. (taking the story all the way) Overall, well done
14	601	Cash V Card	HC	Fits the brief very well. Well thought out and excellent composition by way of balance with the fanned effect of both the real money and the plastic cards
15	601	Now and then	C	Nicely done still life of the old and new, well composed. Not sure what part the fauna plays in the foreground, although a minor point

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - Feb 2021- Subject - Old V New -- Judge - David Skinner

Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: - HC (Highly Commended) - C (Commended)

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	
-------------------	-----------	-------	--------------	--

16	866	Flinders Street		The brief has been met. However, the scene is rather busy and the story of old and new is a bit lost. Try just a shot of the dome and the modern building behind, something less complicated to tell the story
17	431	How Things Have Changed	C	Like the previous shot of Flinders Street station, however, the skyscrapers to the left, that merge with the masts of the old sailing ships tells a better story. Suggest cropping a bit off the RHS a tad
18	447	Landline Phones		An old and newish? phone meets the subject brief. Taken from the top, yes shows how the keypad has replaced the rotary dial, but experiment with different camera positions to improve impact. Nicely balanced angles of the phones
19	866	Liam and Great G	C	Excellent portrayal of the story, but how about having great grandpa nursing bubs to capture his handsome ageing face, a more engaging image.
20	770	Movement		What is old, what is new? Difficult to catch on to this one unfortunately
21	869	novice_Brownie&Fuji	HC	In this image, the maker has taken the shot looking straight down. It works because it has a complimentary background, well positioned subjects and interesting wood grain that help balance the image, Nice and sharp, lighting handled well
22	863	novice_life_goes_on		Well seen, interesting concept. Beautiful texture in the old log. Try a slightly better angle moving round to the left more to put the new growth in the foreground with the old log behind it
23	863	novice_new_old_tree		Well seen also, but the subject tree is lost in the background of similar trees. Try this again (if possible) moving around 360 degrees around the subject looking for the best composition to show off the subject
24	863	novice_resurrection	C	Similar story with new growing from old. Lovely textures, and the harsh light has been handled well. The angle the shot has been taken adds interest and shows off the subject well.
25	326	Old vs New1	C	This image tells a good story. The gold around the face of the clock lacks some detail. Perhaps some side light might have helped. A slightly less

			vignette might work better. Just a minor thing, but the old clock should have been set to 4.55, not 3.55
26	326	Old vs New2	Interesting still life, but all the items are old?
27	326	Old vs New3	The brief has been met with an old and new building. A diptych is perhaps not the way to best portray the set subject. The images are okay as individuals, both well composed with good definition. Could a stronger architectural story with more impact be found in one image?
28	326	Old vs New4	Similar theme with this image, nothing wrong with either image, both well taken and handled, but is it a powerful image?
29	399	architectural contrast (A PRINT ALSO)	HC This image is well seen and well composed. The story of old architecture and new architecture in one image is much stronger. Lots of shapes that add interest. The harsh light though has not been your friend. Try under exposing so the detail can be brought out PP
30	447	Push Bikes	Good symmetry and angles of the bikes, this composition works fine, but the background does not compliment very well. It may have been the best available in the back yard, perhaps take them down to the park or similar with depth of field to have a blurred background.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - Feb 2021- Subject - Old V New -- Judge - David Skinner

Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: HC (Highly Commended) - C (Commended)

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
31	770	Regeneration	C	Very interesting image... haven't the new trees got a way to go! Well seen, harsh light handled well. Nice composition Blue and green, with the vivid white works well
32	431	Restoration	HC	Fantastic concept in this case with the diptych style. It tells a story. The restoration to "new" is well executed yet still retaining early the sepia look. It is fairly easy to go back and forth to see the detail brought out
33	431	The_Female_Form		Very intriguing image that does grab one's attention to study the paintings behind, even though the woman is admiring the statue, not the paintings. The image title for the set subject is a little confusing and a long bow has been stretched in my opinion
34	770	Victoria_Harbour	C	Good concept, but is the junk that old? ... probably a minor point. Taking the image as a whole, well composed, the junk is very sharp, offset by the very steamy balmy background with the modern skyscrapers and cruise ship vs the sailing ship
35				
36				
37				
38				
39				
40				

