

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
1	852	7th Wave	C	<p>You have taken this at a beautiful time of day! I love the warm colour pallet that it has generated. You have chosen a good shutter speed that allows tat capture of both texture and some blur to suggest movement. The exposure has been well handled although you have some overexposure in the wave. I would suggest lowering your exposure level in post to bring the detail out in the wave. I believe that to make this a stronger image you could crop the left hand side and place the wave on the 3rds line. The image is slightly over sharpened as seen by the halo on the cliff and you have some splash spots in the right hand top corner.</p>
2	305	Silverleaves beach at sunset		<p>This image has a lot of potential! The rocks and beach provide a good leading line to the people as the main focal point whereas the wet sand and water reflection provide a good leading line to the sun. The exposure has been well handled but the image will benefit from some post production editing. I would suggest that you need to decide which is going to be your subject and edit for that. At the moment you have 2 subjects that are conflicting; the people (the human eye is always drawn to people) and the sun (the eye is drawn to the brightest object) and so the viewers eye is cycling between the people and the sun.</p>
3	487	Different Dahlia	HC	<p>I love the artist treatment that you have given this image. The complimentary colours of the flower and the leaves and background work well together and allow your main subject to stand out. As is I feel that the image is unbalanced and suggest that maybe duplicating the leaves into the upper corners may give it more balance. When using a dynamic colour as a background such as the pure black you need to ensure that it is black with no unintentional bits on show. In this image you have a splog to the left of the flower where it looks as if something has been erased. There are also a couple of spots. I would suggest using a cloning tool to remove these areas.</p>
4	487	Photo Opportunity		<p>I love the story that is being told in this image and I agree that autumn is a great time for photography. In this image you have some great colours that need to be enhanced; I suggest that both contrast and saturation be increased to bring</p>

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				<p>out those colours and I would also suggest that the image be cropped to exclude the path as the path does not add to the image.</p> <p>Well seen image and you have taken the opportunity to grab a great image.</p>
5	487	Ship's Bell		<p>An interesting artistic treatment. You have a very strong subject with an almost monochromatic background that appears to be very fog like in its treatment. The alignment of the bell support is not parallel to the image side, but if you straighten that then the horizontal rails are out of alignment; you may try a perspective crop or you could really push it out there and really rotate the image to give another perspective altogether and turn this into an abstract image.</p>
6	487	Storm on Horizon		<p>This image has been taken at a lovely time of day, which gives a warm palette to the foreground area attracting the viewers eye. The sky has some really nice texture which is worth an image on its own. The position of the marker, in the centre of the image and also being a bright yellow against a dark background, make it the centre of attention for the viewer. The name of the image "Storm on the Horizon" indicates that you want the centre of attention to be the storm which is behind the marker. I would suggest that you move to one side and use the grass as a leading line to the storm.</p>
7	869	After the rain	C	<p>A nice sharp closed landscape having a good diagonal line from the bottom right up through the waterfall. You have used a good shutter speed allowing you to capture the movement in the water. You might consider lifting the shadows on the left hand side. You may also consider using the Orton effect as I think it would work very well in this image.</p>
8	325	Bathing		<p>Certainly a beautiful day for bathing! You have positioned the main group of people very well on the thirds line and with the other group of people provide a good leading line to the boats. The image is soft and slightly out of focus, the water and clouds also show signs of pixelisation, this maybe caused by over</p>

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				cropping of the image or the low 72dpi image. When saving an image try going for the highest possible resolution.
9	431	Beauty_in_a_Roadside_Weed	C	I love the name of the image! I also like the treatment that you have given this image using a white background I think works very well with the subject matter. As there is no metadata I cannot tell what aperture was used but it appears to be around 3 to 4, I would suggest using a higher F stop of around 7 to 8 to allow a greater depth of field bring more of the flowers into focus. You may consider cropping the image to a square format as this usually adds strength to the image.
10	431	Cucumber_Tendrils	C	This image has a nice diagonal lie through it. You have used the available lighting well to enhance your main subject and separate it from the background. A good depth of field has also been used. The image is pin sharp on the main subject. You may consider doing some dodging to darken the brighter areas of the background foliage.
11	399	dad and the kids		A nice family group shot. I like the low angle that this has been shot from. The image is well balanced with the positioning of the chicks and dad. With no metadata I cannot be specific but I think a larger aperture of around 5.6 , depending on your zoom may have separated the birds from the background a little more. I'm not sure what has caused the "red" eye on the male bird but that needs to be fixed.
12	325	days end		You have some great texture in the sky. I like the positioning of the horizon low in the image as this gives prominence to the sky and makes it the focal point. In this image I find my eyes are drawn to the bright cloud in the upper area of the image. When the image is turned over my eyes go tot he same place; this indicates that the main focal point is the upper sky. I suspect however that you are trying to capture the colours of the sunset. The best time to capture the colours is just after the sun is below the horizon; you took this image at about 4 minutes after 5, sunset was around 5:40. With the sun below the horizon avoids blown out areas and then clods are then lit by a warm light.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
13	770	dusk_dip		An interesting concept. In these type of images the sun is usually blown out as is the case here and because the camera is seeing the bright light the main subject are made into a silhouette. I really like the concept of this image but next time you may consider moving slightly to the right to have the bright sun reflection going through the group as it will be an amazing leading line; also drop the exposure way down to ensure the main subjects are only a silhouette. You can do a similar thing in this image in post production. I also think that the sand adds nothing to the image.
14	601	Delicately Fragile		This image has a very subtle diagonal line. The muted light background works well in this image. The artistic treatment of the out of focus main subject gives a feeling of gentleness and fragility to the main subject. I would suggest a slight vignette to centre the viewers attention onto the flower and cloning out the separate green leaf.
15	601	Evening Light		This is certainly a beautiful light and I congratulate you for not looking the other way as most people will be photographing into the sun. The image is sharp where it needs to be and the image is well exposed. I suggest that your depth of field is too deep as the boats in the back are distracting and a shallower depth of field would have lessened their impact.
16	601	Golden Morning		Great time of day for image making! The colour palette that you have is very small tending to the warm end of the spectrum. Don't be afraid to pull the darks down toward black as this image is all about the golden light. I suggest making the pier foreground and hills into a silhouette. This would also help remove the noise from the hills.
17	601	Stormy Takeoff	C	A very atmospheric image; you have used a good shutter speed to attain a sharp image yet slow enough to suggest movement in the propellor. The horizontal colour banding in this image adds a great deal of impact and I suggest need to be highlighted. You have positioned the plane well on the thirds line to add impact to the image. I would suggest a touch more contrast

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				or curves to make the grass pop. Watch out for dust spots particularly in the sky.
18	431	Entry_to_the_Safe_Harbour		The water in this image forms a lovely S curve taking the viewers eye into the image. The rocks in the foreground are taking the viewers eye into the pole. In this image I get the impression the photographer was unsure as to the main focal point of the image; is it the pole, the water way or the colour in the sky. With the horizon being through the centre of the image does not give importance to either part of the image. Viewing the image on a photographic monitor, the foreground becomes very dark and overpowering, but moving it to a standard monitor the image loses the colour in the sky. Possibly converting the image to monochrome and deciding what is your main focal point and editing the image for that.
19	399	eyes on the ball	HC	A good sport / photojournalistic image. As Henri Bresson would say you caught this image at the decisive moment. This requires planning and anticipation of the game. I like the position of the batsman on the thirds line. You may consider increasing the contrast to give the image more pop and make the batsman stand out more, also I suggest darkening the background to lessen the impact on the image.
20	326	Eye-to-eye	HC	A good emu portrait. The image is sharp in the right places with the background being nicely blurred enabling the main subject to stand out. The bright patches behind the emu's head are a little distracting and I suggest you consider darkening them; this can be done by dodging or by editing in lightroom. I suggest a little more sharpening on the birds head will bring out the lovely texture. Also think about this as a monochrome.
21	377	Finch		Your choice of aperture has provided good separation of the main subject from the background. You have used a good shutter speed of 1/1000 s to be able to get good detail in the bird, however for some reason the birds feather are blurred and have lost detail although the eye is sharp. It is possible that over sharpening as shown by the halo maybe the possible cause. I would

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				recommend in future that you do not use aperture priority when photographing birds as this allows the camera to set the shutter speed and you require at least 1/1000s (as you have here) as a minimum shutter speed and upwards of 1/2000s for moving birds, by using shutter priority you can set the shutter speed and then allow the camera to set the aperture and iso.
22	361	Flannel Flowers		A still life of flowers that has potential. I like your use of a black background as this highlights the main subject. At the moment the flowers appear to me to be a little washed out, I think that by increasing the exposure or the highlights detail will make the flowers stand out more. I would also suggest that you consider cropping to a square format. Consider a lower angle perspective when shooting. I would suggest that you have a look at Anotly Che's work on still life.
23	770	Icy blast		You have used a good compositional tool by photographing along the fence line and focusing on the first pole for your focal point. Your exposure has been well handled. The shooting position adds height and power to the fence. You might consider increasing contrast and exposure a little to give the image a bit of a kick; also you might consider turn this into a monochrome.
24	377	Marbles Shadow	HC	In this image you have pushed the saturation but it works well enhancing the warm colours from a setting sun. You have placed the tree nicely on the Fibonacci spiral to add strength to the image. The image is well exposed and sharp throughout. The dynamic range add interest to this image.
25	641	Marlo	HC	An interesting concept using a panorama format to enhance the horizontal lines of the image, providing a calming feel to the scene. The complimentary colour palette of the green reeds and the blue mountains also adds to the sense of calm in the image. This image reminds me strongly of Rhine 2 by Andreas Gursky. This image also shows that you can take lovely images even when the sun is high in the sky..

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
26	326	Meeting the Swaggie		A nice family photo taken in very difficult lighting conditions. You have good interaction with the two adults but the child is looking off to the side. Also when taking portraits you should not cut off people at the joints. Before you press the shutter button look at the background to avoid post coming out of the shoulder. This can be removed in post production.
27	852	Mildura predawn	HC	A good long exposure image where you have control your exposure reasonably well although there are a few over exposed areas in the lights. The image is sharp through out although i would suggest that you are careful of not over sharpening the image as there is some evidence of a halo around the sharp edges. Also watch out for dust spots in the sky.
28	326	Mist over the Bight		A nice atmospheric image of the mist and some really nice textured rock. You may consider moving slightly to the right to include the sweep around the corner. I would also suggest that you consider increasing the contrast as this will help bring out the wonderful warm colour palette. Watch out for dust spot in the sky.
29	866	Misty Fence	HC	An ethereal feel to this image is enhanced by soft focus that has been applied to this image. The warm palette works well in the image and the track in the grass parallel to the fence combine to form a good line into the image. I would suggest you consider cropping the top and bottom of the image to eliminate the distractions of the sky and dark grass.
30	325	morning light	C	You have captured a beautiful warm palette in the morning sun. The mist in the distance add to the feeling of isolation. You have composed this image very well with the road leading the viewers eye into the image and the bright sky the eye back. This image is 1130 x 1080 pixels, a square format is more pleasing and restful to the eye as the eye does not need to move around the image as much and it allows you to centre your object. In this image it will allow you to remove some of the upper sky.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
31	866	Newhaven Pre-dawn		A beautiful dawn image with just enough atmospheric condition to give those interesting light beams. The colour palette in the sky is amazing, graduating from the warm yellows through to the cool blues. I feel the central area of the sun is slightly over exposed and the brightness can be decreased by reducing the white levels. This can also be avoided by taking the shot slightly earlier, say at around 7:15 instead of 7:47, also consider using a graduated ND filter as this will allow you to get more exposure on the foreground.
32	325	No Surf		I love the potential story in this image of the surfers are ready but there is not surf. In photography we talk about the weight of object in an image, here the eye goes to the 2 people standing on the path, it then goes to the pine tree, because of its position and size. I would suggest an image taken slightly to the left using the line of the surfboards as a leading line, taken from lower down leading you to the surfer on the wall would be a stronger story. This is a well seen image.
33	641	Nobby's		The Nobby's is always worth taking image of. Compositionally the image ticks many boxes, you have a straight horizon, which is in the upper part of the image giving prominence to the foreground. The camera was on auto mode and has selected F5.6 at 1/500s and ISO of 200. This has caused a problem in that most of the image is out of focus because F5.6 will give you a fairly shallow depth of field. Try using the aperture mode and setting the aperture to around F8 not only will this give you a greater depth of field your lens is sharpest between about F7.1 through to about F11.
34	863	Novice misty_mountain		You have some really nice texture in the sky and around the mountains with the mist. The image has been well exposed but appears flat. I suggest that you increase the contrast and saturation slightly to make the image pop. I would also suggest that you crop out the tree on the right. I feel that the image has not had a lens correction done as the trees on the right are all leaning into the image.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
35	863	Novice storm_warning	C	What a dramatic sky. You have used the foreground to provide added interest in the image and a good leading line. The contrasting shades of the white and grey work well in the image. I suspect that when you took this shot you focused on the distant shore or clouds as a result the pier is slightly out of focus. When shooting this kind of scene it is a good idea to use an F stop of about F8 or 9 and focus on the red marker; this will ensure the pier is sharp.
36	863	Novice misty_mountain_lane	C	You have used the leading line of the road to good effect. The mist on the mountain is dramatic and worthy of a photograph. I suggest that a portrait format would have created a stronger image by providing a vertical tension as the left hand side does not do a great del for the image.
37	447	Passion Fruit Flower	C	In this close up, you have chosen a good aperture to provide a good depth of field from a macro lens so that the main subject is sharp and well separated from the background. The complimentary colour of the blue and yellow work to draw the viewers attention to the red stamin. I like the off-centre composition.
38	866	Pier View	C	This image has a lot of potential. You have lovely warm colours in the sky and some nice texture in the pylons of this well exposed image. In this image you have used the pylons to frame the sun rise and this is well done. The pylons also form a strong gestalt pattern, however the line of pylons form a leading line taking the viewers eye out of the image. I suggest that you consider cropping the right hand side and then increasing the shadow luminosity, contrast saturation and decrease sharpness a touch.
39	447	PRINT Green Bottle Fly	HC	A very good macro! The eyes are pin sharp which is what you wanted. The ascending diagonal placement adds strength to the image by leading the viewer through the image. You have achieved very good separation from the background. Some judges may be critical of the shallow depth of field with the far wing being out of focus. To increase the depth of field you could use an aperture of F13 instead of F9 as the macro lens shorten your depth of field.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
40	869	PRINT Hidden Creek	HC	A very nice scene with a strong diagonal composition leading the viewer through the image. This must have been a still day as a 1/20 sec shutter speed has provided a little movement in the water. The image a well balanced and exposed. The square format allows for the central placement of the main subject and the slight vignette help to retain the viewers eye. You might consider investigating the Orton Effect as this will really enhance this image.
41	869	Rusty dawn		A good long exposure (186s) that has some warm colours in both the foreground and the sky. I like the low shooting aspect giving a sense of being part of the environment. I feel that in this image you have 2 major focal points, the shed and the sun rise and both are on opposite sides of the image causing tension whereas the image is trying for a calm feeling. I suggest that you crop the shed out, this I believe will provide a good C curve from the foreground rocks to the dawn sky, it will also give a good colour balance between foreground and sky. Alternatively you could crop the left hand sky and head land so that you have the shed, rocks and water.
42	377	Sax Player abstract	HC	I love the concept of this image. The colour palette used makes the main subject stand out from the background and provided background interest. I would suggest that you consider cropping to a square format as this will place the eye on a power point within the image and better balance the green a yellow background.
43	770	sleeping_giant	C	Great well seen simple image that is well exposed. You have done well to isolate the main subject by eliminating all other distractions. The perspective from your shooting position add size and strength to your subject. You might consider bringing out more of that texture and colour in the rock and also adding a vignette to retain the viewers eye.
44	399	succulent		The complementary colours of the organic main subject combine to isolate the succulent from the texture of the background. This is a simple well exposed image that I think would benefit from some post processing to increase its

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				impact. Being a minimalist image you need to remove all distractions such as the pine needles.
45	326	Tawny Frog Mouth Owl		Tawny Frog mouths make great subjects. Your composition using the diagonal branch from the lower corner of the image works well to lead the eye into the image. So compositionally your image works well, however the over exposed sky I think has caused some funny issues with the colour across the image and this can be corrected by converting the image to black and white, then by increasing contrast, sharpening etc. you can sharpen the image which is soft because the shutter speed was only 1/50s. For stationary birds you need around the 1/1000s to consistently achieve a sharp focus.
46	641	Three Pelicans		This is certainly one way to minimise extraneous objects from the image. You either love it or hate it. Knowing the trend in photographic circles this may not do well in high level competitions. Having said that the diagonal bar through the image is good and the Pelicans are sharp and well exposed. It was good timing having the centre Pelicans wings up and I like the story of the fight between the Pelican “I want to sit here” and the human position of “no you wont”. Well done on a courageous effort.
47	361	Trio		This is an interesting still life interpretation of the lilies. The portrait format works well with the tall flowers, enhancing their elongation. The high key treatment against the dramatic black areas stands out nicely against the white background. This type of image demands simplicity in the background, in this image there are a couple of areas with black smudges that need to be removed.
48	869	Under cover		A pleasant river scene that you have captured in this well long exposed image. The image is generally sharp from foreground to background and the colour treatment has been well handled. The one major problem is the fern leaf that has moved, this needs to be cloned out which will take some work. I recommend that when taking this type of image that you not only take the

Phillip Island Monthly Club Competition – Judge Feedback for - May 21 - Subject - OPEN-- Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
				main long shutter speed image but also a higher shutter speed image that you can merge with the main image if you have a situation like this.
49	770	Vastness		I agree with the sentiment, it is a vast landscape. You have done well to ensure that the horizon in both the mirror and the larger landscape match and this composition tells an interesting story of the vastness of our country. It would have been nice if one of the segments in this image was sharp as that would have given real impact to this image.
50	431	What_a_Tangled_Web_We_Weave	HC	A nice finely detailed monochrome image; you have composed the image well placing the centre of the web on the golden ratio power point. The F stop chosen gives a good depth of field to isolate the web for the background. I like the juxtaposition of humans mimicking nature. Your monochrome treatment suits the simplicity of this image.
51	361	White poppy		This is a very simple image with a plain black background. The white and black compliment each other and the yellow stamin draws the viewers attention. The texture of the petals could work to provide added interest but the soft focus detracts from this texture. An out of focus composition can work very well but it must look as if the out of focus was deliberate. You may want to investigate pin hole photographers such as Justin Quinnell.
52	399	wimmera windmills	HC	This architectural image exhibits a good dynamic range and sharpness. The monochrome format is suited to the sharp lines of the main subjects. You might consider lifting the colour mix when converting to monochrome to give the foreground a bit more punch. When removing object be careful of the cloning process.
53	377	Wyndham Sunset	HC	A very nice silhouette with some impressive colours in the sky. I like the layering effect of the clouds. Our shooting perspective adds staure to the boab trees and the position of the foreground anchors your image. You might consider editing using the dehaze and texture sliders to remove some of the noise in the image.

