

**Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation - Judge Feedback for – Feb 2024- Subject –OPEN- Judge – Paul Robinson**

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended) 25%=10 awards*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
1	870	<b>Black Beauty</b>		Akin to chiaroscuro lighting. Vertical format portrait. Work as a typology.
2	641	<b>Bushy Yate Gum</b>		Radial composition. Black enhanced colours. Technically competent. See Man Cheung (Australia)
3	399	<b>Castlemaine diggings</b>		Representational with useful lighting. Historical perspective. See Richard Daintree (Australia)
4	870	<b>Chookie</b>		Quality portrait. Cold-warm colour contrast. Excellent use of controlled depth of field.
5	326	<b>Cornflower</b>		Contrasting geometric & organic shapes. Treatment debatable. See Luka Esenko (Slovenia)
6	884	<b>Cowes Fireworks</b>		Colour works. Straighten verticals & noise reduction. People bottom right great to include but tone down.
7	399	<b>Crested Pigeon</b>		Environmental portrait. Lighting suits. See Bence Mate (Hungary)
8	884	<b>Eaglesnest</b>		People give scale. Noon light is harsh with bright sky. See Ian Rolfe (Australia)
9	641	<b>End of Day</b>		Peaceful. Silhouette complements the scene. See Louise Denton (Australia)

<b>10</b>	862	<b>Farm NightSky</b>		Hundred-year-old equipment as history. Implements could be as dark silhouette. Great sky.
<b>11</b>	862	<b>Farm NightSky1</b>	<b>HC</b>	High quality image of the Fordson tractor and sky. Lighting well understood. See Richard Tatti (Australia)
<b>12</b>	431	<b>Feel the heat Bullara station</b>		Dryness is obvious. A long lens shows radiant heat which distorts scenery. It is a classic Aussie landscape.
<b>13</b>	866	<b>Hobart Dawn</b>	<b>C</b>	Cloud on top of Mt Wellington is not common. The 'Annandale" is a visual distraction. An hour later, with strong light Constitution Dock comes alive with light.
<b>14</b>	870	<b>Holy Cow</b>		Captured the furry hide well. With these gentle cattle the horns are paramount. The eye retains our attention.
<b>15</b>	866	<b>Japanese Maple Leaf</b>	<b>HC</b>	A poetic piece of nature photography. Similar in style to traditional Chinese painting & photography. The drips and black background set the mood.

**Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation - Judge Feedback for – Feb 2024- Subject –OPEN- Judge – Paul Robinson**

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	
16	862	K'Gari		Excellent linear perspective. Lighting a tad flat. Good range of visual texture.
17	431	Lovely Lichfield		The slightly overcast light helps. Good range of visual texture. See Peter Dombrovkis (Tasmania)
18	889	McGrub	<b>HC</b>	Superb timing. Background competently handled. See Klm Wormald (Victoria)
19	866	Myrtle Falls		The geology is restful (Horizontal lines) and the token waterfalls enhance this. Potential for mood in winter. See Tzido Sun (Japan)
20	326	Nodding Violet		Color captured reasonably well. Treatment debatable. Try a technique rather than program filter. See Paulette Tavormina (USA)
21	887	<b>NOVICE - Meerkat</b>		Captured the body language well. With

				zoo photos recognize distracting environments. Animal is sharp.
22	887	<b>NOVICE – Pacific Gull</b>		Great timing. Straighten image. Captured the mood quite well. See Bence Mate (Hungary)
23	887	<b>NOVICE – Rainbow Lorikeet</b>		The habitat suits the bird. Sharp. Useful depth of field. See Heather Thorning (Australia)
24	870	<b>Open and shut</b>	<b>C</b>	Pelican photos are a dime a dozen, iconic, but you have captured a moment that is a narrative. We can see the fish dinner. See Melissa Groo (USA)
25	889	<b>Pigeon Eye</b>	<b>C</b>	Sharp with mesmerising eye. Diagonal composition helps the visual dynamics. See David Tipling (UK)
26	889	<b>Playing with Food</b>	<b>C</b>	Narrative with decisive moment. Could possibly get closer. The cassowary is unique and is clearly seen.
27	326	<b>Potato Flower</b>		Complementary colours (Yellow/violet) work well. Background visually distracts. Design handled well. See Tatiana

				Skorokhod (Ukraine)
<b>28</b>	447	<b>Print - Blowfly</b>	<b>C</b>	Quality macro. Background a tad distracting. Great depth of field. See Thomas Shahan (USA)
<b>29</b>	447	<b>Print - Pelican Portrait</b>		High key suits. Try auto contrast to lift quality. Good depth of field and eye contact. See Marcus Varesvuo (Finland)
<b>30</b>	875	<b>Print – SS Speke</b>	<b>C</b>	Excellent night sky. Shipwreck depicted at useful angle. See Richard Tatti (Victoria)

**Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation - Judge Feedback for – Feb 2024- Subject –OPEN- Judge – Paul Robinson**

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
31	875	<b>Print - Swamp Harrier</b>	<b>C</b>	Caught well in flight. Challenge - photos of birds in action (feeding, fighting etc). Technically competent.
32	447	<b>Print – Would you like a fillet</b>		PJ style narrative. Person at rear is a distraction. Rapport captured well.
33	361	<b>Ready to Multiply</b>		Lovely B&W. Classic still life style. Excellent tonal range with depth of field.
34	487	<b>Retired from the Railway</b>		Straight rendition. Covered wagon potential for abstracts or other details. See Jim Pearson (USA)
35	487	<b>Safe in Port</b>		Dramatic owing to weather. Red interpretation is a warning as to what is about to occur. Lower angle to minimize background yachts would help.
36	361	<b>Scottish Thistles</b>		Thistle singular !! Quality representation. Try backlighting as the seeds float away !

<b>37</b>	884	<b>Seaweed</b>		Straight rendition. Pristine environment. Shape could be interpreted as a bird in flight.
<b>38</b>	399	<b>Silver eye</b>		Captured well. Could be a tad sharper. Challenge - thinkj in terms of narrative.
<b>39</b>	431	<b>Summertime at Saltwater</b>		Lovely lighting. More appealing than most jetty photos. Good range of viusual texture. Plane provides third dimension.
<b>40</b>	361	<b>Thistle Down Faeries</b>	<b>HC</b>	Beautiful abstract pattern. In post-production try to avoid repetetition. Like the title.
<b>41</b>	487	<b>Tropical Delight</b>		White frangipani?? Sometimes best to pick them and set up as a still life. See Man Cheung (Australia)
<b>42</b>				





--	--	--	--	--