

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation – Judge’s Feedback for DEC 2025 Subject PORTFOLIO Judge Dave Summer FAPS

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDI
1	325	Portfolio Architecture		
2	325	Architecture TITLE PAGE	n/a	n/a
3	325	Architecture 1		I feel that whilst I like the effect that this filter produces, just using a standard filter within PS is not conducive to a good architecture shot, many judges won't even look at an image using this type of filter. Looking at the 4 images, I feel that your best shot has been detracted from by the use of this filter. Also, I think you may have been better including a title image instead of putting the subject down the right side of the building. You may disagree with me but that is how I feel about this image which was likely the best one.
4	325	Architecture 2		What I like is that your number of subjects is an odd number. What I think might improve this image is to get right in front of the centre building and have them straight as opposed to tapering away to the left. Also, you might have been able to remove the red building from your image too. Also, the telegraph pole on the right side and the wire heading out of it may have been better removed too. This seems to me like you had walked past before noticing and did not or could not go back although that probably isn't true but, that is the impression I get. Remember if it doesn't need to be in the shot or add anything to the scene, do not include it.
5	325	Architecture 3		What I do like is that you have captured a human in the shot and that for me is what the pavement is for so why not have them in it. I just wish he was going the other way and not away from the camera. There is some lovely light on this building but unfortunately it is marred by the lamppost. The red and white pole and the street sign to the left of the flagpole. Again, maybe a straight on shot would have been better here and then get someone to sit on the steps so you still have that human element. This reminds me of a statement by Thomas Heaton, a UK Landscape Photographer "not every beautiful scene makes a great picture" and I think that this is what you have here.
6	325	Architecture 4		There is no reason why you cannot have something modern in your architecture however, if you the horizon must be level and here it slopes to the left. Not only that but the sign is a distraction and the round bush is too. I know this is cliché but, if you had stepped right, hid the sign behind the bush and then got the image level and more straight on then it might be a lot better.

7	326	Portfolio Through the Fisheye	C	Portfolio Overall Commended
8	326	Through the Fisheye Title Page 1	n/a	A very good idea to show the title in an image that links it to the others, I like it. However, the title has too much space between the words (Vertically) and centralising them would have helped here I think, but stick with the fisheye effect of the curved writing.
9	326	Warrumbungle Tree 2	C	You've really thought outside of the box here and produced an excellent set of images too. I like how the tree does not go off the edge anywhere, well done however, this is not a fisheye image and it does not speak of a fisheye to me. Unless the purple ring is supposed to be a fish's eye. Just be careful with your titles when words mean two things like this, perhaps a better title might have been 'Through the Eye of a Fish?'
10	326	Opera House 3	HC	What a fantastic shot of the Opera House and again you've kept it within the edges. I also like the sky. This is more like a fisheye shot and I love the inclusion of the people to give us some scale not that we need scale on an icon like the opera house. This is a well thought and well executed shot and different too.
11	326	Malmsbury Bridge 4	C	I don't mind the bridge going off the edges but the trees are a very small mistake. That said, it still is a very good image and a little fish eye style as well. Maybe better to show what the bridge is for, trains, cycle and footpath or cars etc. I don't mind the tree with no branches through the arches but I may have removed the telegraph pole with the white cross bar in the far left It is a case once seen and I can't stop looking for it.
12	326	Clock 5	C	I am starting with a negative, what shame about the dark area on the left. However, again you have captured the entire clock within the frame. This is definitely a fish eye shot what shame about that blue panel behind..

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation - Judge's Feedback for DEC 2025 Subject PORTFOLIO Judge Dave Summer FAPS

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDI
13	361	Portfolio Mixed Bunch	HC	Portfolio Highly Commended Overall
14	361	Mixed Bunch Title Page 1	n/a	n/a
15	361	Sunflower 1	HC	I have always thought that yellow on black worked well and you have proved it right here. What an astounding image, depth of field is often a challenge and you've nailed it in three out of four of your images. The KISS principle has been demonstrated here very well. Depth of field has to be spot on with an image like this and you have it perfect. Well Done
16	361	Flannel flower 2	HC	This flower reminds me of a spider with its legs ready to pounce, what a stunning flower this is? Although I might have cropped the grey stem from the bottom. Depth of Field is perfect again but it does tail off very slightly on the two front petals. Try focus stacking to get it sharp if you can't get it.
17	361	Protea 3	C	I am not as keen as with the other images, the colours are not as stand out and the depth of field is a slightly out. Still, it is impressive to a point but no stem leaves it hanging in the air so to speak. Also, the depth of Field is nowhere near as good on this one as the other three with the petals and stamen dropping off at the rear.
18	361	Lily 4	HC	This is a Calla Lily and is one of my favourite flowers to photograph, but I have to say you have made an amazing effort here, well done. The stamen is in a perfect position and the light is stunning and looks natural. I also like how you have it to the left hand side of the image with the flower on the right, brilliant.
19	399	Portfolio Earth		
20	399	Earth Title Page 1	n/a	Nice Title Page although these high images have been a bit done to death now.
21	399	Earth 2		Not so much to focus upon in this image although there are a few water channels visible. Not too sure why but it doesn't look even and seems to be sloping left somewhat.
22	399	Earth 3		This image almost has a leading line but unfortunately, it leads to nowhere. You really need to have more of a point of focus to look at like in in your fourth image.

23	399	Earth 4		Again there is very little to focus on as a main subject, we need a main subject. This image does have some points but they seem to be at the edges when we look centrally first
24	399	Earth 5	HC	This image has a little more substance than the other three having a focal point or two with the rocky ridges although the more dominant is in the lower right corner. Please remember that images in a portfolio have to be good images in their own right as well as similar subjects for the portfolio.
25				
26	487	Portfolio Waters edge		
27	487	Water's Edge Title Page 1	n/a	How can I argue with a title page like this, spot on and straight to the point?
28	487	Andalsnes Norway 2		This is a very nice image although many scenes like this needs to be balanced. As it is the whole image is right sided. Yes, it is a water's edge shot but Thomas Heaton's statement springs to mind again as quoted in the Architecture Portfolio above. There is no need to name the location in the title, it really is of no concern although it does help slightly in knowing where they are. I hate to say this but, you are obviously well travelled so it comes across as just name dropping, sorry.
29	487	Isafjodur Iceland 3		Here we see a couple of boats, the larger of which makes the scene a little unbalanced with the left side being heavier. Sometimes less is more and I wouldn't have included the cruise ship, just the smaller boat and made more of the settlement in the distance.
30	487	Torshavn Faroe Islands 4		This a better-balanced image and the grassy roofs add some interest. However, I would not have included the car in the scene. If this is about the reflection, it has worked because the reflection is not challenging the scene to be more dominant. I think I would have chopped off the left side of the image because it adds very little to the scene except distractions. Likely, I would crop this right down the left edge of the red building. This leaves some people in the image for scale.
31	487	Lerwick Shetland Islands 5		A very nicely balanced image, not a seascape but definitely water's edge. What I really like is the group of people to the left of the person in the orange jacket, to give context and scale. Again the horizon is not level and slopes to the left. Please note that the horizon is present even when you cannot see it. Images should always be levelled regardless as the first basic edit. Unless of course they are deliberately angled.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation - Judge's Feedback for DEC 2025 Subject PORTFOLIO Judge Dave Summer FAPS

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDI
32	866	Portfolio – Back Lighting	C	Portfolio Overall Commended
33	866	Back lighting Title Page 1	n/a	A nice partial silhouette image with the sun shining through the iris blades in the lens giving the flare effect.
34	866	Backlighting 2	C	A lovely well-handled image, shooting into the sun can be an image ruining process but here you have managed it well. This is my favourite shot although the sun only needs to be implied not too bright in the sky as it is here. I really like the depth of field effect you have here.
35	866	Backlighting 3		Yet another well-handled image with a misty morning, I like the foreground interest and the fence is a leading line to the mist. Then the mist is a leading line to the sun. However, everything in the foreground is far too dark to be of much use especially on the right side. That said, the sun here is not too bright in the scene.
36	866	Backlighting 4	C	I am not sure how you have managed to get so much detail in the foreground but the tree on the left is quite silhouetted. Still, you have managed this very well. The sun is big and bright but I feel the low cloud has almost saved you here. While the sun is there, there is not much evidence of backlit trees in this shot?
37	866	Backlighting 5	C	It had to happen, one image had to be a full on silhouette and this is it. The image is a little right-hand side heavy with background hills almost balancing out the scene. The seagull is a great touch, nice and sharp but it might have been better flying to the right and further to the left to balance out the hills on the right side. Currently, the seagull is a little too centred and the sun is just way too bright. Again, the sun can be inferred rather than in the shot.

38	875	Portfolio Feathers and Fur	C	Portfolio Overall Commended
39	875	Feathers and Fur Title Page 1	n/a	This for me works well as the title image because it shows us what is to come, I like that as long as the pictures are worth looking at and these are.
40	875	Feathers and Fur 2	HC	I think this is a Dotterel and boy what a lovely shot. The birds eye is nice and bright, it is sharp and the colours are fantastic. Unfortunately, it is not doing much, so there is no story and sharp and bright just do not cut the mustard these days.
41	875	Feathers and Fur 3	C	I am not normally a fan of this type of Duck shot but, I have to take my hat off to the photographer as this is one of the best I have seen to date. From the water droplets right to the Duck's eye being bright and sharp, everything is so very well done that I am very impressed with this shot..
42	875	Feathers and Fur 4	C	I have a very similar shot to this in my wildlife portfolio but mine is not as good as this shot because in my shot the Joey has its other arm across the mother's neck and is looking at my camera where here the Joey is looking in its mother's ear. A very nice image that almost looks like the Joey is shouting in Mum's ear for attention?
43	875	Feathers and Fur 5	C	What a great swamp Wallaby shot, so very well taken indeed. In the grand scheme, not too hard to get but done very well.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation – Judge’s Feedback for DEC 2025 Subject PORTFOLIO Judge Dave Summer FAPS

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDI
44	884	Portfolio Well Being Walks		
45	884	Wellbeing Walks Title Page 1	n/a	Again, I really like this type of title page and the idea to make the image Monochrome inside the title box works very well. It means you’ve thought about the title page.
46	884	Wellbeing Walks 2		Unfortunately, the sea is too calm and the light is quite harsh. Otherwise, a shot like this would work well with a slower shutter speed. However, you have some great light under the jetty. Unfortunately, I do not get the portfolio title and how the images fit to that? Also, this image is taken at the wrong time of day even for under a jetty, I would try a time lapse shot instead.
47	884	Wellbeing Walks 3		IN a shadow competition this shot would work really well. However here it doesn’t make much sense even with the title of Wellbeing Walks. I still do not understand the link between wellbeing walks and these images? I mean, I know what a wellbeing walk may mean but, I don’t tie the pictures to this?
48	884	Wellbeing Walks 4		I am so sorry but I don’t see the connection between a wellbeing Walk and the discarded Schweppes can. The image is good it is just the context that is missing for me. Maybe picking up other people’s discarded litter is good for your wellbeing?
49	884	Wellbeing Walks 5		Again, I don’t see the relevance, maybe I am missing something here but this image does not shout Wellbeing Walk to me, sorry. Maybe this is knowing you have a table booked is the wellbeing especially if it is a busy Sunday?
50	885	Portfolio Painted Desert Sunrise	C	Portfolio Overall Commended
51	885	Painted Desert Sunrise Title Page 1	n/a	Having lived in an Aboriginal Community, I know how hard it is to get shots like these. The photographer makes this image as he not only gives a dynamic element but he also balances the hill to the left.
52	885	Painted Desert Sunrise 1		What a great sky and an almost perfect silhouette. However, I wish there was something on the right to balance out the hill such as tree or a rock. The problem with the image is there is nothing to hold my attention, nothing to look at.

53	885	Painted Desert Sunrise 2		A really well taken image but it needs a dynamic element to give us scale and some life like some Aboriginals' or a car just to give some scale. Again Thomas Heaton is singing his song. Zooming into part of a scene like this will eliminate and parts that are not well lit like the background rocks to the right of the hill.
54	885	Painted Desert Sunrise 3	C	Here the trees give some scale and the image is balanced fairly well However, the top of the hill being right on the horizon line does not help this image at all and creates a conflict in my opinion. Shoot from lower down and it will make the rocks feel way bigger and stop any conflicts
55	885	Painted Desert Sunrise 4	HC	Now this is exactly what I was talking about in image 1, the tree balances out the hill and this image works really well. What a shame about the big black shadow in the bottom left corner? As there is nothing else with such a dark shadow, I can only assume this is a vehicle parked up. This definitely the best image of the 4 with balance and interest, just watch the shadows.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation – Judge’s Feedback for DEC 2025 Subject PORTFOLIO Judge Dave Summer FAPS

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
56	888	Portfolio Kati-Thanda		
57	888	Kati Thanda Title Page 1	n/a	I really like the map idea in the corner; it helps us identify where it is.
58	888	Kati Thanda 2		Another set of what look like drone or aircraft shots. Unfortunately, there are somewhat are excellent images like these that have been around for 10 years +.and images like these are very has been these days. That said, these are of a particular lake and almost pass muster.
59	888	Kati Thanda 3		What should be a stunning image has no focal point to rest our eyes on turning the image into geometric shapes. Unfortunately there is no scale with an image like this which means we have no idea how high we are?
60	888	Kati Thanda 4		This image has some detail on the ground but it is difficult to know whether these are very small or really big hills so some context would help here? However, this is definitely the best image in the portfolio for me, there is some interest and something to look at.
61	888	Kati Thanda 5		Again, without context and something to compare these too, we struggle to know how big these features are? Looking at this it does not matter if there is anyone in the shot to give scale because I don't think we would see them anyway.
62				
63	889	Portfolio Raptors & Their Behaviour	HC	Portfolio Overall Highly Commended
64	889	Raptors Behaviour Title Page 1	n/a	I gave this a Commended because I know how hard it is to get a shot like this so very sharp. For some reason I was thinking Velociraptor rather than birds of prey, no idea why?
65	889	Searching for Lunch 2		How do we know this Nankeen Kestrel is searching for lunch? That said the shot is very nicely taken with nice light apart from on its tail. The key with birds is getting their eyes right and you've nailed it here. Maybe the shadow on its tail may have been avoided but at least you got it sharp? I might have removed the out of focus branches on the left side, the KISS principle always applies

66	889	Raptors Lunch 3	HC	Now this is a class Wildlife shot of a Goshawk with a Rainbow Lorikeet as its dinner. There is mistaking that it is lunchtime here. What a masterful shot and well done for being there.
67	889	Raptors Courtship 4	HC	Again, this is a masterful shot of what look like two Grey Falcons doing a bit of courtship. Well we assume it is courtship, it may just be a fight. What another wonderful wildlife shot this is too, well done.
68	889	Raptors Confrontation 5	C	I am not quite sure what is happening here but the Wedge-Tailed Eagles seem to be having quite the tussle. Again, what a greatly timed shot and just being there to capture this is just mind boggling. When I look for them they are always soaring at about 1,000ft up in the sky.

69

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation - Judge's Feedback for DEC 2025 Subject PORTFOLIO Judge Dave Summer FAPS <i>Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: HC (Highly Commended) - C (Commended)</i>				
Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
70	892	Portfolio Moto GP		
71	892	PI Motor GP Title Page 1		I guess being on Philip Island is perfect for this type of image and I may be incorrect but I think that this is the only portfolio I have seen taken on the island. That said, you really need to learn the panning technique more. The idea is that you set a shutter speed say 1/60 th of a second and then pan with the bike, focussing on the rider on a set path with enough DoF to get them and the bike sharp. You pan with the bike, take the image with the camera panning and carry on until the image is taken. You will know when you've got it right. Because the bike and rider will be sharp and anything moving such as the wheels and the background will be blurred. Remember
72	892	PI Motor GP 2		While number 23 seems sharp number 33 is definitely blurred and they need to be sharp. Also, the bike intruding on the top of the screen plus the white line do not add to the scene at all. I feel out of the 4 images on show this is the only none photo-shopped image of the group. There is a depth of field issue with the sharper bike being the rear of the two. Also you are either zoomed in too far, stood too close or have cropped the image too much because no bike is in the field of view fully..
73	892	PI Motor GP 3		Something is not quite right here, perhaps the background has been blurred or maybe the bike was photo-shopped in but it doesn't look right. However, the curb should be sharper in

				front of the bike than away around the curve. This tells me you blurred the background and then photo-shopped in the bike but your blending has not worked very well.
74	892	PI Motor GP 4		What gives this one away is the triangular bits at the bottom of the tyres, I think it was to blur the background. For me you need to learn the art of panning because the wheels are far too sharp, see the writing on the title page for help.
75	892	PI Motor GP 5		With a shot like this, I can see why you would want to blur the background. However, there is just too much red, desaturation in the background would have made this bike stand out much more. If you are going to cut and paste in the bikes like this, then shoot the background at the same time because here the light does not match and the tarmac by the wheels should be sharper than it is.
76	896	Portfolio Into the Jungle	C	Portfolio Overall Commended
77	896	Into the Jungle Title Page 1	n/a	What a great cover page however, less is more here and the Tiger looks like it might eat the parrot. I really like the short rhyme at the bottom though. I find it odd how all of the animals here are also at Melbourne Zoo? There is nothing wrong with that but for wildlife they cannot be captive animals. If they are at the zoo, give yourself a pat on the back for not showing the zoo enclosures at all.
78	896	Golden Tamarin 2		Unfortunately, the Tamarin is leaning left and might slide down that log at any time. That said its eyes are bright and it is nice and sharp with a good depth of field. I still think this is a Zoo shot.
79	896	Mum and Bub 3	C	What a great shot of Mum and Bub it is too, you have got right in there. We can still see what they are though and I like the arm that grounds the image well. A really nice image very caring as well.
80	896	Orang-utan 4	C	Yet another close-up image that works well. Eyes are nice and bright and focus is spot on. This image plus they are all at Melbourne Zoo is what gives it away for me?
81	896	Red Panda 5		Yet another nice image but not quite as good as the last two. Did you know that the Firefox browser is based upon a Red Panda like this one?

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation - Judge's Feedback for DEC 2025 Subject PORTFOLIO Judge Dave Summer FAPS

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

[illegible]