

GENERAL COMMENTS:

1. Digital images are viewed on a 32" Proart calibrated RGB photographic monitor.
2. The novice grade was very difficult to critique as two of the three images were 267 x 400 pixels and 500 x 359 pixels, these tiny sizes require the images to be expanded losing all sharpness and resolution.
3. I like using the metadata as it enables me to provide specific recommendations, yet many images do not have the metadata.
4. I assume that every image is attempting to be an artistic image as opposed to a scientific or photojournalistic image. Except where it is obvious that it is a PJ image.
5. I will, generally, not be commenting on global exposure or sharpness as modern cameras tend to capture these aspects very well.

Topic

Club definition

Our May 2026 Evaluation topic is 'Story in Three Shots' to be judged by Gary Smith A single photo speaks volumes, but a three-image sequence truly invites viewers into a storytelling experience. This method succinctly structures your story with a beginning, middle and end, keeping the viewer more focused and engaged. There was even an example given.

Many photographers have chosen to approach this topic by either creating triptychs or creating 3 separate images.

In photography there are polyptychs, portfolios and photo essays:

Polyptychs are a series of two or more images that have some sort of connection, such as B&W, portrait format or the same subject, they may or may not tell a story. Portfolios are often treated the same as a polyptych but are also often an example of an artist's best work with each image not necessarily having any connection to another image.

Photo Essays are the visual equivalent of a written essay in that it must tell a story, therefore must have a beginning, a middle and an end.

This topic is 3 Image Story, in essence it is a photo essay, therefore the 3 images must tell a story, and the story must be obvious to the disconnected observer. So, for a triptych generally we will have from the left or top 3 images for example an egg, a baby bird, an adult bird. If it is 3 separate images then image 1 is egg, image 2 is baby bird, image 3 is adult bird any other combination will disrupt the story.

In this evaluation the story is king, yes, we want good quality images but a combination of 3 poor quality images telling a story will trump 3 high quality images without a story.

When shooting an Essay, it is a good idea to have the story in mind and then shoot the story. This way you will have consistency throughout your images, and they will then clearly tell the story.

Breakdown the personal photographer's barrier, you know the subject or location but does the viewer?

To ensure that I was not missing anything I showed these images to another judge, other photographers and to non-photographers over a wide demographic.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation – Judge Feedback for – May 2026 - Subject – 3 Image story - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI
Set 1	431	Filling the Loch	C	A fine autumnal image where the vanishing perspective leads us to the boat and church in the distance.
	431	Entering the Loch		A calm relaxed sensation as the boat slowly makes it way into the full loch.
	431	Lowering In the Loch		The boats gone! Why has the boat gone! An almost claustrophobic sensation of the boat in the narrow confines of the loch.
				There is a strong story with these three images with the first two being shot from a similar perspective although from opposite sides of the loch, the church is in kind off similar position, it is the third image that is very different with the church almost out of the image and causes some jarring in the viewer.
2	885	Triptych – Back to back	C	The first image has been shot from a standing position creating an inferior or vulnerable feeling to the subject there is too much foreground with the subject being too close to the top of the frame. The centre image is the hero of the set showing the spinning wheels and people knitting, however the subject are under exposed. In a triptych consistency is important, here the outer images do not align.
3	912	Triptych – ClayPan Connection		This triptych has 3 high quality images that are well presented in the single frame with the first two having a similar editing approach while the third has a much brighter exposure and suggest more movement. The story I don't feel is obvious and requires deep thought. I think the story may have been a meeting in the morning with the freedom of being alone in the environment. The continued connection throughout the day and the departure of one of the party by days end. The connection to the claypan can only be that the couple met on the claypan.
4	912	Triptych – Desert Blues		Another triptych with beautiful images where the connection is, as the name indicates the colour blue. The first image shows a set of diagonal tracks leading to the waters edge creating a feeling of aloneness in the vast expanse, while

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation – Judge Feedback for – May 2026 - Subject – 3 Image story - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

				the second image is of a salt encrusted log placed diagonally within the image, activating Maslow's fifth level, that of curiosity. The final image is a well balance sunset image creating a sense of peace and calm at the days end. However, there is no story connecting the 3 images.
5	889	Triptych - Duckling Hunting	C	A well-presented triptych. Individually they are excellent shots with the large negative space creating a sense of the vulnerability of the duckling and its tiny activity. Combined they narrate an obvious story. The images have plenty of breathing room between them. The editing is consistent throughout the sequence.
6	889	Triptych – Egg thief	HC	A verry strong story with the confrontation between the Raven and Terns, followed by the fight and then the winner and reward for the victor. Each is is beautifully shot and processed, each image is balanced. Consider adjusting the editing so it is all the same, notice the green of the vegetation varies.
Set 7	875	Egg Snatch 1	HC	Similar to the previous triptych, each image is beautifully shoot with a powerful story connecting them and showing the confrontation, the steal and the escape. Unlike the previous triptych each image has similar editing, notice the foliage is a similar hue and the raven is placed in a similar position within each image and because of these little details I think it is a stronger Essay.
	875	Egg Snatch 2		
	875	Egg Snatch 3		
8	911	Triptych - Hiking		As in reading the reader does not read word by word or line by line, the eye darts all over the page. A reader expects certain queues and consistency in these queues is important. A good book can be killed by poor production values, and it is the same with a Photo Essay. Here the information flow is good from the top left via a C curve to the bottom image flowing as a viewer would expect. However, the borders are an important part of the presentation and are inconsistent with a big white blob in the middle. Consider moving the left image down to the centre of the right-hand image. Also remove the dust spot from the bo9ttom image.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation – Judge Feedback for – May 2026 - Subject – 3 Image story - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

9	885	Triptych - Hoodies	C	Another strong story of the courtship, the nesting and the resultant chick. This is a good example of a triptych being a strong contender for an award despite a poor image, the chick is out of focus but is a very important image within the story. Consider editing the images to have the same look and feel.
Set 10	361	Isaac 1		3 Cat images taken at different times, representing I think 3 different stages of growth from kitten through to older cat, although the metadata does not support this idea. The first image of the kitten in a different pose to the following two images. The second image pose implies a “Whats that” attitude while the third pose implies a “Piss off” attitude by the cat. Each image is well shot but the story is not obvious.
	361	Isaac 2		
	361	Isaac 3		
11	911	Triptych - Perfume		From the farm to the product, these images convey the process of creating a product based on Lavender. The first image is shot looking down the rows of lavender, although I suggest cropping the sky’ the second in the factory where you could crop the people; while the third image is very busy and using subdued lighting, consider selecting one product as the final image. As in reading the human eye looks for clues as to how we progress through a written passage, if this is not clear then the passage becomes difficult to read. It is the same with a photo essay, here we have different sized images that are positioned inconsistently within the canvass.
Set 12	326	Print - Memorable Moments 1		3 separate image, the first a fast flowing river framed by the tree with rocks leading the viewer into the image; a graduate filter has been applied to the top to enhance the clouds and presented with a white and black border. The second has no border but has a vignette applied while the white water is over exposed, consider using a polariser or bracketing your shots. These two images have a connection but the third is not connected to the first two although it does trigger Maslow’s fifth level, The circular edge is a good
	326	Print - Memorable Moments 2		
	326	Print - Memorable Moments 3		

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation – Judge Feedback for – May 2026 - Subject – 3 Image story - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

				leading line. The sequence name suggests that the three image have a special meaning to the photographer but this is not communicated to the viewer.
Set 13	325	Print – Evening light 1		The concept for this series is good, the gradual change in light as the sunsets. The images have all been taken at the same location with the same focal length. Because of the auto exposure mode each image has been taken at a different shutter speed and metering mode creating a different look and feel to each image. While each image is good with strong leading lines and aesthetics, the 3 images do not flow. Also consider the colour profile you are using, Display P3, this causes issues when displayed on computer monitors and some websites. An sRGB colour profile is a standard for all electronic devices.
	325	Print – Evening light 2		
	325	Print – Evening light 3		
14	889	Triptych - Romance	HC	A well-presented Photo essay of the birds mating, all images have been taken from the same position with similar lighting and editing. The whole sequence is consistent and predictable by the viewer. Consider adding a touch more exposure to the birds' eyes to bring them out a little more.
15	885	Triptych – Sanny Channel swim		A story presented in 3 varied format images placed diagonally on the canvass with the first and third being long distance shots while the centre is a closer shot of the swimmers. The layout on the canvass has created large negative spaces commenting on the vulnerability of the swimmers. Consider other layout formats as this one has caused the start to be very small and possibly missed by the viewer.
16	912	Triptych – When I grow Up		A series of 3 individually good images, I guess taken at a station. We see men roping and wrestling cattle and the third image showing two boys hanging onto a fence, we assume they are watching but the story is not really clear here. All images have their strong points with the editing being consistent including the lighting on all images.

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation – Judge Feedback for – May 2026 - Subject – 3 Image story - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Set 17	487	Where am I - 1		The story here is, I think, arriving on a cruise ship, at the main port and the town. It appears to be an overcast day resulting even low light with soft shadows. Consider editing the image to bring out the wonderful colours of the buildings as this is a standout feature of these towns.
	487	Where am I - 2		
	487	Where am I - 3		

Phillip Island Monthly Club Evaluation – Judge Feedback for – May 2026 - Subject – 3 Image story - Judge – Gary Smith

*Please refer to Judge Instruction Letter for ratings: **HC** (Highly Commended) - **C** (Commended)*

Sequence by Title	Member No	Title	Judge Rating	EDPI

